



MEETING MINUTES

Chief's Advisory Committee (Virtual)

Thursday, March 18, 2021

Welcome to Committee by Chief Páez

Chief Páez welcomed the committee. Thanked all for coming together again today. He turned the meeting over to Chair and Co-Chair Judge Maynard and Ms. Ajmeri Hoque.

Dwayne Maynard welcomed all to the meeting. Thanks to all attending the virtual meeting, special thanks to Ajmeri for coordinating the agenda, Chief for being accessible between meetings and to Rebecca and Becky for their behind the scenes efforts coordinating the meeting.

Committee members present: W. Dwayne Maynard, Ajmeri Hoque, Cameron Justice, Susan Ortega, Imran Malik, Isao Shoji, Stella Villalba, Sri Gaddam, Yanling Yin; Police Department members present: Chief Justin Páez, Lt. Nick Tabernik, Lt. Greg Lattanzi, Director Jay Somerville, PIO Rebecca Myers, Officer Amber McCloskey, Corporal Devin Howard; Guest: Corporal Jake Stoll

Minutes by: Becky Metcalf

Committee Business

- **Attendance**

Chief called roll for the meeting:
Judge Dwayne Maynard - present
Ajmeri Hoque – present
Sri Gaddam – present
Cameron Justice – present
Yanling Yin – present
Susan Ortega – present
Isao Shoji – present
Stella Villalba – present
Imran Malik – joined later
Cortney Ingram – not present

- **Review/Amend/Adopt Last Meeting's Minutes**

Previously posted amended minutes were reviewed by the committee. Dwayne Maynard asked if anyone would like additional time to review the minutes. The committee members did not request additional time. Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to accept or adopt the minutes from February 2021 as they have been amended. Ajmeri Hoque moved to accept the minutes from February 2021 as they have been amended. Sri Gaddam seconded. Dwayne Maynard asked that all in favor of accepting the February 2021 minutes as amended signify by stating "I"; all responses were in favor. Dwayne Maynard asked if anyone opposed; no responses were received.

Amended meeting minutes from the February 25, 2021 CAC meeting were adopted as amended without objection.

Old Business

Dwayne Maynard asked Rebecca Myers if there was any old business. Rebecca advised there is no old business. She did advise Chief Páez had some topics to discuss to answer questions from past meetings. Dwayne Maynard moved into the Chief's Update to the Committee to discuss and review those topics.

Chief's Update to Committee

Chief Páez presented a PowerPoint of the Dublin Police Department annual awards ceremony. Volunteer of the Year presented to Community Service Officer Joe Sanderlin; Leadership Award presented to Corporal Jace Dalgord; Civilian Employee of the Year Records Supervisor Wendy Greasamar; Civilian Employee of the Year NRECC Communications Manager Amy Heger; Officer of the Year presented to Community Impact Unit Investigator Dave Jaeger. A video will be posted on social media to acknowledge publicly all employees within the department who received awards throughout 2020. Additional recognition as part of Women's History Month: SRO Kathy Evans, Sergeant Renae Rice, Detective Andrea Shull and Officer Jordan Fraley. Additionally, Chief Páez shared a publication currently in the New York Times, a collection of essays written by high school students, one of which was written by Levi Burks, student at Westerville High School and daughter of Officer Paul Burks. ['When Normal Life Stopped': College Essays Reflect a Turbulent Year — Levi Burks' entry.](#)

Director Jay Somerville updated the committee on mutual aid agreements. The police department is signatory to four such agreements. Two agreements are with Franklin County specifically; one is with Delaware County specifically and the final one is with the Union County Sheriff's Office. ORC 737.04 authorizes municipal corporations to enter into these mutual aid agreements. The Franklin County agreement is broken into two separate mutual aid agreements: 1) Emergency Mutual Aid; to assist with man-power and/or resources during an emergency 2) Non-Emergency Mutual Aid Agreement; desired by the Franklin County Chief's Association allows for non-emergency situations; allows an officer from one jurisdiction to take enforcement action within another jurisdiction should there be an observed threat to public safety. The Franklin County Agreements are administered and maintained by the Prosecutor's Office. 3) The Delaware County Mutual Aid Agreement is for emergency response and requires that a request and receive be made from the requesting agency; all police departments are signatory to that agreement including the County Sheriff. 4) The Union County Mutual Aid agreement is a direct one to one agreement with the Sheriff and is an emergency request and receive structure, which comes directly from the Sheriff. Director Somerville asked if there were any questions from the committee regarding the mutual aid agreements.

Dwayne Maynard thanked Director Somerville for the information and invited questions from the committee. Isao Shoji asked why Columbus chose not to be a part of the non-emergency agreement. Director Somerville advised that he does not speak for the Columbus Police Department. He was part of the drafting of the agreements and at the time, the City of Columbus did not want to see the requirement that they be notified and asked before an action was taken. They also have a standard stance about contracting out police services in any way and it was their opinion to enter into the non-emergency agreement would violate that long-standing

practice. Dwayne Maynard asked how many police chiefs ago for Columbus was that; Jay advised possibly three. There were no additional questions from the committee.

Dwayne Maynard asked about a press conference that occurred earlier in the day. Police Chiefs for municipalities throughout Franklin County got together for an initiative called "Operation Game Over" dealing with youth violence and criminal activity. He wondered if our police department was part of that effort.

Chief Páez advised Dublin is not part of and was not present for the press conference today. We provided a response to a media request received after that press conference and provided information about what we have experienced here in Dublin. We do collaborate with jurisdictions throughout Central Ohio on issues of crime that transfer between communities but Dublin did not participate in the press conferences. There are no operations that we are involved with currently but we do share information or respond when necessary. He deferred to Lt. Tabernik to offer additional response.

Lt. Tabernik advised that operationally we do have connectivity with those departments that participated today. We take violent crimes that occur in our community very seriously, we assist in pooling resources to address crimes that have become issues of community concern in Dublin. Dwayne Maynard commented on how all that coincided with the discussion on mutual aid agreements, but partnership seems to be a thing that all departments attempt to do with one another and it does not have to be impacted or affected by a mutual aid agreement. He asked if this was a fair conclusion. Chief Páez confirmed advising there are natural organic tethers between communities and shared resources sometimes requiring us to travel into another community to resolve criminal incidents, share resources, and ensure safety in both communities.

Chief Páez deferred to Director Somerville to review Special Meeting Response – Director Somerville advised that being a charter city in a home rule state the requirements of a public body to give notice is outlined in our City charter and our Dublin City Code. The requirements are 24-hour notice to public and to the members of committee. Notification can be accomplished by placing a notice on the city's website. The posting must include the time, place and statement of the general purpose of the special meeting. The special meeting can then be held 24-hours after the notification is posted. One other special requirement is any news media members that have given specific notice that they would like to be informed of any special meetings must be specifically notified. As of right now, there are no requests on file at the clerk's office. Dwayne Maynard thanked Jay for the follow-up and asked in light of the additional information if Imran Malik and Sri Gaddam had any additional questions. Imran advised he did not have questions and thanked Jay for the additional information.

Dwayne Maynard asked if there were any updates from Chief Páez or Isao Shoji regarding the CTF. Chief Páez deferred to Isao Shoji. Isao advised they had a standard agenda and shared sub-committee reports. Homer Rogers presented to the committee going over the history and progress of the DEI efforts of the City of Dublin. Steve Francis was also a guest and went over terminology used when talking about DEI. He shared a resource put together by the Pacific University Oregon DEI glossary. Isao suggested this might be appropriate for the CAC committee to review as well. See link below:

<https://www.pacificu.edu/life-pacific/support-safety/office-equity-diversity-inclusion/edi-resources/glossary-terms>

Chief Páez had the additional opportunity to meet with members of the youth subcommittee of the CTF. They have similar questions to those of the CAC. They asked about body cameras, training and the use of force policy. He added that if the CAC committee is interested in having Steve Francis present at one of the upcoming meeting those arrangements could be made.

Dwayne Maynard thanked Isao and Chief for the update. He advised the CTF and CAC committee chairs were not able to meet prior to this meeting. The meeting is scheduled for early April. He asked how this might impact the timelines previously discussed related to reporting and coming up with the blueprint related to public safety to be provided by the CAC.

Chief Páez advised that he did not get a sense that the CTF is tied to a definitive date but they have a framework of when they would like certain pieces to be accomplished knowing their deadline to return a comprehensive report to City Council is in August. The City Manager is working toward providing an update on the progress the CTF has made to City Council around April 6. Chief Páez advised, and if acceptable to the CAC, that he will work on memo to share with the group and get input from the CAC to provide an update to council as well. Chief Páez feels the CAC is in a good place to reconcile that timeline once leadership from both the task for and committee come together.

Old Business

Dwayne Maynard asked Cameron Justice to provide an update on potential recommendations for the Dublin SRO Program.

Cameron outlined final thoughts regarding the SRO program and suggestions hoping to get some tangible recommendations by April 1.

- 1) Evaluations – some component from students
- 2) SROs being linked to resources for students
- 3) Training Opportunities (potentially having the committee to sit in on some training)

Dwayne Maynard advised that April 1 might be too ambitious as Spring Break is coming up and some committee members may not be available. Additionally, Chief will be providing a memo for council's consideration in early April. He suggested taking additional time. Stella Villalba advised she looks forward to working with Cameron on this and the additional time will help. Cameron agreed to extend the timetable for his intended recommendation.

Dwayne Maynard advised he had the opportunity to listen to the WOSU event on 3/19 on the issue of race and policing and healing the divide. He shared some thoughts related to terminology for all to keep in mind: social and racial injustice; unequal justice in administration of the law; distinction between bad cops and bad policing; trust between the community/communities and the police department being something that is earned; and to heal the divide it is necessary to make connections and find common ground. He asked if there were any questions. There were no questions or comments from the committee.

Response to Resistance (Use of Force) Presentation

Lt. Lattanzi introduced Corporal Jake Stoll, a member of the supervisory staff and an instructor. Corporal Jake Stoll continued the presentation on the department's response to resistance and rendering aid. (For full presentation go to: <https://dublinohiousa.gov/boards-commissions/chiefs-advisory-committee> meetings from 2/25/2021 and 3/18/2021)

Rendering Aid – Policy 301.04

Cpl. Stoll advised that it is common practice that no matter what level of force is used medics are contacted to evaluate the subject. Officers will provide intermediate care until their arrival. The Dublin Police Department and Washington Township Fire Department have a good working relationship and participate together in training opportunities.

Lt. Lattanzi advised that the policy has been at any time our officers use a response to resistance, we automatically ask the township to respond and evaluate the individual and ensure they have proper care to treat any potential injury. Lt. Lattanzi asked the CAC if they had any questions.

Ajmeri Hoque asked how many warnings they would give a person before taking action? Lt. Lattanzi responded that there is not an absolute answer, some situations require immediate response. Some situations we can deescalate and give more warnings but it is on a case-by-case basis, as some instances require an immediate response to prevent harm.

Ajmeri Hoque asked how the training differentiates between someone not following orders and just being difficult and someone who is actively being aggressive toward you. Chief Páez advised that it is sometimes easier to provide a situational example rather than talking in generic terms. He then shared an incident where he (a corporal at the time) and Lt. Lattanzi (an officer at the time) responded to a domestic situation.

Sri Gaddam thanked Chief Páez for the information. He asked if there had been any specific incidents where an officer overreacted or misjudged a situation which led to the need for additional training. Chief Páez advised that is part of the review process. Every incident where a response to resistance occurs goes through a review process to ensure the actions and responses by the officer were necessary. If a problem is identified, retraining can be offered, corrective action can be taken and/or the department can consider if the policy, direction and training provides the foundation for officers to keep themselves safe and address situations where resistance has occurred. The policy also addresses the duty of an officer to intervene and duty to report if they observe a response to resistance beyond what is reasonable.

Ajmeri Hoque asked how the organizational review is conducted; do you have bodycams? Cpl. Stoll advised any time an incident occurs where response to resistance occurs the officer fills out a form documenting the incident by the end of their shift. The supervisor is immediately notified and follows a checklist of responsibilities; the review is basically conducted like any other investigation. All documentation is collected in a "case packet" including a large section for the officer's narrative. Once complete, the report is turned into a supervisor. Next it is reviewed by a defensive tactics instructor for review (i.e., did they react how trained, did it fall within policy). This multi-layered system does take time for review. Then it goes to a Lieutenant for review and on to the Chief for review. For each review, there is an investigative summary of findings. Officer McCloskey advised we do have body cameras; all officers are equipped with them. They come on automatically when overhead lights are turned on in their cruisers or they can activate them

manually. Cameron Justice asked if there is an audio delay or backtrack. Lt. Lattanzi advised there is a 30-second lookback function. They do not capture audio for the lookback period. Cruisers also have cameras; anything that would take place in front of a cruiser would be recorded. He considers the body camera a benefit for these reviews.

Ajmeri Hoque asked if you can move the cameras to the back. Lt. Lattanzi advised yes you can move the cameras inside the car about 45 degrees and Cpl. Howard advised there is also a camera that covers the back seat of the car at all times as well.

Imran Malik asked about DPD jurisdiction where it overlaps with Hilliard, Columbus, Union County and Plain City are there standing MOU's between all those departments. Chief Páez advised for ongoing incidents or occasions Dublin moves into or where a bordering department may come into our jurisdiction, Dublin does work in partnership with those other agencies.

Iman Malik asked if there are training opportunities in those overlapping communities or joint efforts to reduce overlapping crimes. Chief Páez deferred to Lt. Tabernik who shared some of the work done on a regular basis by the Community Impact Unit as well as efforts in partnership with the Delaware County Drug Task Force, Delaware Tactical Unit (a joint tactical unit comprised of Delaware County departments) and the Human Trafficking Task Force. The recent crime spree of motor vehicle thefts, occurring throughout Columbus and the surrounding suburbs is another example where departments can pool resources to address those significant incidents impacting communities in the region.

Imran Malik asked for data to compare crimes over various years to consider and compare what can be done on behalf of the police department and the CAC to ensure those numbers remain low. Chief Páez advised he would send out, in advance of the next meeting, several years of activity to provide an awareness of what crimes have occurred in Dublin.

Dwayne Maynard asked Rebecca Myers if she had sent out additional information that looked back on some offenses from 2019 and 2018 between the last meeting and tonight's meeting. Rebecca advised she had sent out some information but can make them specific to Imran's request; she will resend the information.

Dwayne Maynard asked if the body worn camera policy received from department would be a separate topic presented at different time or part of the current discussion on use of force. Lt. Lattanzi advised it was sent out to provide the CAC some framework on the policy but he believes it would be important enough to have a meeting specifically on the topic of body cameras to provide a better understanding of the equipment. Rebecca Myers had previously sent out the policy to the CAC for review.

Dwayne Maynard asked an additional question about the rendering aid policy, which was last revised this year dated 2/9/2021; was there anything specific that happened that led the administrative team to decide this policy needed revision. Lt. Lattanzi advised that all policies are regularly reviewed but also in light of current events and community concerns we wanted to make more clear internally and externally for the public specifics of that policy.

Susan Ortega commented about training in preparation for situations that may lead to conflict and along with that, a key piece is how to best support officer wellness in general. Overall

wellness and ensuring that officers and staff are in a good mental space prior to going into some of these situations is an important piece of the training.

Dwayne Maynard asked what Dublin Police Department's position is in terms of either contracting trauma experts who are available for calls or new training specialization so more officers are trauma aid ready to assist. Chief Páez thanked the committee for bringing forward the discussion and consideration for trauma informed care as a potential training topic for the future. Lt. Tabernik continues to collaborate with Steve Click, who is with the Ohio Mental Health and Addiction Services, to work on building a pilot program for that training within the agency and hopefully rolling that out over the next year.

New Business

Ajmeri Hoque wanted to give some space for the Asian American Hate that is going on in the country right now. Dublin has a large Asian population, overall in Ohio it is 2% and overall in Dublin, it is 20% and although this is happening in another city miles away, it affects our community members. She asked how to help our Asian community members and be proactive and ensure our community members are safe. She opened the floor to any other CAC member who would like to speak.

Imran Malik thanked Ajmeri for bringing the recent incident into the discussion. There is a large Asian population all over Ohio especially the Asian American Commerce Group, which caters to about 30 different Asian Country's population that calls Ohio home. He agrees there has to be some visibility even though things happen in other parts of the country it definitely impacts our community here.

Yanling Yin spoke about a comment when COVID first started that it was a Chinese virus. This caused much anxiety and concern in the Chinese and Asian community. Friends and people in the Chinese community created a chat group for persons to give an "SOS" if they are attacked to ask for help. She had not heard of any incidents but it causes anxiety and stress. She asked if there had been any increase in crimes or disputes against the Asian community. Chief Páez advised we did not have much in calls for service or reports filed in Dublin; but it is important to talk about those incidents that have occurred across our country and talk about them collectively together. He stressed the importance of leaning out and extending a hand to anyone that is struggling or is in fear as no one should be uncomfortable or fearful in their community. The police department is your resource to ensure you feel safe and are safe in the community.

Sri Gaddam commented that Dublin Police has been very supportive after something happens and asked knowing that something could happen, what precautionary measures does or has the department taken to assure community safety. Chief Páez advised the department has not always been as active in that role as they hope to be in the future. He deferred to Lt. Tabernik to share some conversations he has had this week with our Community Liaison Officers (CLO).

Lt. Tabernik shared a few points: 1) community outreach through our CLO program and 2) partnerships in a law enforcement capacity. CLOs took a renewed approach last summer into fall to determine how we reach all parts of our community and proactively reach out to them. This week, Cpl. Morris who operationally oversees the CLO program, is charging his officers to reach out, offer a hand, an ear, and remind our community that we do not stand for this and answer any questions or offer any support that can be provided. He asked members of the CAC to reach

out if you have recommendations or opportunities for enhanced outreach or questions. Secondly, for example the incident with the Michigan Governor reviewed by the CAC in a previous meeting, the department has good connectivity with the FBI, specifically with the Columbus branch of the public corruption and civil rights task force. He reached out to the agent with whom the department has most connectivity and asked what resources they could provide to the CAC and our community. He offered his direct phone number, which he will share with the group via email, also pamphlets that are hate crime, related that the FBI disseminates. Those will be shared with the CAC as well. He encourages you to also share that information with community members and advised that the department is open to anything you can do to provide additional connectivity with our community.

Chief Páez thanked the committee and asked for any input to connect more directly to community members who have concerns or fears. He realizes that coming to the police department to file a report can be intimidating. The department is willing and can travel to a location where they may be more comfortable. The department is flexible, adaptable and willing to provide resources wherever necessary. He asked the CAC members to help think through more effective and efficient ways to deliver that service directly to make everyone feel comfortable and safe in our community.

Imran Malik agreed that the more outreach they can build on behalf of the department is helpful. He shared a personal scenario that happened at the New Islamic Cultural Center, which is in the jurisdiction of the Hilliard Police Department. He advised their location has received hate mail and racist behavior by outsiders who are not part of the congregants. Hilliard Police built a relationship with the center and allowed the opportunity to develop more outreach. Additionally, they brought in the FBI and the Fusion Center of Columbus leadership as a resource as well.

Sri Gaddam suggested one way to help bridge the gap is by inviting members of the department to attend community events or gatherings. Understanding and learning about different cultures, helps bring the community together.

Isao Shoji thanked every member of Dublin Police Department in attendance. He has spoken with community members and they do feel much safer here in Dublin as part of the Asian community. He advised what shocked him most about this terrible event was that he was not necessarily shocked that it happened and that within their community not a whole lot of people were surprised that it happened. He stated that when he realized that, he was sad and disappointed that this is how we find our country and there are many that feel that way in their community. He went on to say that multiple people have changed their pattern of living; where they go and how they spend their time and specifically spoke of his wife not being comfortable in certain parts of town, limiting interactions or changing destinations to where she feels comfortable. He advised that she feels safe in Dublin but not necessarily outside of Dublin. He asked how we might be able to improve on what we already have; for instance training that deals specifically with hate crime. He commented about there being no uptick of reports in the city but feels this is a type crime that is vastly unreported; he has heard about multiple incidents where people have had racial slurs directed toward them. He wonders what if any training would make a difference but that you have to identify those incidents first and encourage reporting; a lot of things happen that do not rise to the level of a crime but it does directly affect people's safety and security. He additionally stated that messaging is important. As a member of the committee he hears and knows how much people care but the rest of the community of color and the Asian

community may not hear that and especially public messaging in an official capacity is very important.

Chief Páez thanked Isao for sharing and was saddened that anyone feels that they have to alter their life in response to fear or concern for their own safety. He appreciates the committee members for their input and for bringing to the forefront the importance of public messaging. Also for raising our awareness to how the power of messaging and responding to events that affect our community even when they are not in our community. He and Rebecca recently discussed how we put together messaging to address issues that are very painful for members of our community. He clarified for the committee and asked that they share that the police department takes reports for incidents that occur which are not criminal offenses. These types of reports give the police department the capacity to assess the incident and better understand what the community member is experiencing and how that connects to what other community members may be experiencing as well; if we aren't called we don't know. The information can then be shared at a federal level. Related to training we received training from a federal agent so that we have a better awareness of what the thresholds for hate crimes and reporting that information. The important takeaway is that it does not cost anything for the police department to respond and assess to make that community member feel safe. He asked the CAC members to communicate that message through this group. The police department will respond and reach out even if they are not necessarily in our jurisdiction, if they are close to our community as this can affect our community as we are all connected. He emphasized to pass along this information and use the police department as a resource.

Ajmeri Hoque thanked Isao for sharing his very personal story. She wants to ensure the department knows that these crimes and hateful messages are usually targeted towards women. She commented that women are much more vulnerable to these types of crimes, whether they are Asian women, whether they are Muslim women who wear hijabs, they are much more identifiable and for some reason they are targeted. She suggested possibly using the women in the police department to reach out as they may feel more comfortable and safe talking with another woman.

Chief Páez thanked Ajmeri for her comments; he can take the information back to the officers, who are the right resources to reach out, not only from our perspective but we are mindful from the citizens' perspective.

Ajmeri Hoque also mentioned that half of the story is the Asian community receiving hate but half of the story is how the police department responded; they were telling the assailant's story and making excuses. She felt there is a lesson to be learned for everyone on the boundaries of what should be said to the public when these things happen.

Chief Páez thanked Ajmeri for her comments. He does not want anyone to think that just because the incidents do not happen in Dublin that they are not on our minds and they do not help inform how we respond to our community and how we provide protection and safety.

Ajmeri Hoque asked if there was anyone else who would like to speak. There were no other CAC members who wanted to speak.

Public Commentary

Rebecca Myers advised there were no public comments. She will follow-up and send out information discussed in the meeting.

Dwayne Maynard confirmed there was no public commentary. He thanked all and stated he was appreciative for the conversation and for the department continuing to lean into the discussions. He also thanked Rebecca for her involvement in the efforts of messaging and expressed his happiness that all are working toward common ground. He asked if there was anything else for the good of the order and asked Chief for any final words.

Chief Páez thanked all for a very productive and very full meeting and looks forward to future conversations.

Dwayne Maynard asked for a motion to adjourn. Ajmeri Hoque motioned to adjourn and Imran Malik seconded the motion. The meeting officially adjourned at 7:53 PM.

Dublin Police Department - Contact Information
614-410-4800

Chief Justin Páez
jpaez@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Greg Lattanzi
glattanzi@dublin.oh.us

Lt. Nick Tabernik
ntabernik@dublin.oh.us

Director Jay Somerville
jsomerville@dublin.oh.us

Corporal Devin Howard
dhoward@dublin.oh.us

Officer Amber McCloskey
amccloskey@dublin.oh.us